

Report Identification Number: NY-21-041

Prepared by: New York City Regional Office

**Issue Date: Oct 13, 2021** 

| This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:  A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child. |
|---|
| The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.   |
| The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.   |
| The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.  |
|   |

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



# Abbreviations

|  | Relationships                      |                                       |
|--|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| BM-Biological Mother                         | SM-Subject Mother                  | SC-Subject Child                      |
| BF-Biological Father                         | SF-Subject Father                  | OC-Other Child                        |
| MGM-Maternal Grand Mother                    | MGF-Maternal Grand Father          | FF-Foster Father                      |
| PGM-Paternal Grand Mother                    | PGF-Paternal Grand Father          | DCP-Day Care Provider                 |
| MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother             | MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father   | PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father      |
| PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother             | MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle | PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle    |
| FM-Foster Mother                             | SS-Surviving Sibling               | PS-Parent Sub                         |
| CH/CHN-Child/Children                        | OA-Other Adult                     |                                       |
|  | Contacts                           |                                       |
| LE-Law Enforcement                           | CW-Case Worker                     | CP-Case Planner                       |
| DrDoctor                                     | ME-Medical Examiner                | EMS-Emergency Medical Services        |
| DC-Day Care                                  | FD-Fire Department                 | BM-Biological Mother                  |
| CPS-Child Protective Services                |                                    |                                       |
|  | Allegations                        |                                       |
| FX-Fractures                                 | II-Internal Injuries               | L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts       |
| S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains           | C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking     | B/S-Burns/Scalding                    |
| P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance            | XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment  | PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse    |
| CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use                | LMC-Lack of Medical Care           | EdN-Educational Neglect               |
| EN-Emotional Neglect                         | SA-Sexual Abuse                    | M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive |
| IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/<br>Shelter | IG-Inadequate Guardianship         | LS-Lack of Supervision                |
| Ab-Abandonment                               | OTH/COI-Other                      |                                       |
|  | Miscellaneous                      |                                       |
| IND-Indicated                                | UNF-Unfounded                      | SO-Sexual Offender                    |
| Sub-Substantiated                            | Unsub-Unsubstantiated              | DV-Domestic Violence                  |
| LDSS-Local Department of Social              | ACS-Administration for Children's  | NYPD-New York City Police             |
| Service                                      | Services                           | Department                            |
| PPRS-Purchased Preventive                    | TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy | FC-Foster Care                        |
| Rehabilitative Services                      | Families                           |                                       |
| MH-Mental Health                             | ER-Emergency Room                  | COS-Court Ordered Services            |
| OP-Order of Protection                       | RAP-Risk Assessment Profile        | FASP-Family Assessment Plan           |
| FAR-Family Assessment Response               | Hx-History                         | Tx-Treatment                          |
| CAC-Child Advocacy Center                    | PIP-Program Improvement Plan       | yo- year(s) old                       |
| CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation            | ASTO-Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur   |                                       |



### **Case Information**

**Report Type:** Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Bronx **Date of Death:** 04/13/2021

Age: 2 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 04/13/2021

#### **Presenting Information**

At 12:30AM on 4/13/2021, the BM woke up and breast fed the SC. The BM put the SC to sleep on the bed next to her after she fed the SC. At 6:00AM, the BM checked the SC and found him not breathing. The BM called 911 and EMS arrived and started CPR on the SC until they arrived at the hospital. The ER Dr. took over from EMS and continued CPR. The ER Dr. pronounced the SC dead at 7:05AM.

#### **Executive Summary**

This fatality report concerns the death of a two-month-old male subject child (SC) who died while in his BM's care on 4/13/2021. A report was registered by the SCR on the same date with allegations of DOA/Fatality and Inadequate Guardianship of the SC by the mother. Based on religious beliefs, the family objected to an autopsy. The ME ruled that the manner and cause of death were undetermined.

At the time of the fatality, the SC resided with his parents and two male surviving siblings ages two and three years old. The BF was not present in the home at the time of the incident.

ACS received the report and commenced the CPS investigation within the mandated timeframe. ACS interviewed the family and learned the SC was born premature with a breathing condition and spent six days in the neo-natal intensive care unit after birth. The week prior to his passing, the SC was medically examined and deemed healthy by his primary care provider (PCP). At 12:30AM on 4/13/2021, the BM placed the SC to sleep in the same bed with her. At 6:00AM, the BM woke up and found the SC unresponsive. The BM called 911. EMS arrived at the home, initiated and continued CPR on the SC until they arrived at the hospital where the medical staff pronounced the SC dead at 7:05AM. ACS assessed the SSs in the home to be well cared for, with no marks or bruises. They received early intervention services. ACS also obtained information from pertinent collaterals such as the hospital staff, service and medical providers, school staff, and LE. They did not report any concerns about the family. LE classified the SC's death as Sudden Infant Death Syndrome (SIDS) and stated criminal charges would not be filed against the parents.

ACS held a child safety conference (CSC). The CSC did not recommend court involvement for the family agreed to engage in PPRS services.

During the investigation, the family relocated out of state. ACS requested a courtesy check on the family by the LDSS. According to the LDSS' assessment, there were no identified concerns for the family. The SSs were doing well and had engaged in services to support their developmental needs.

On 6/11/2021, ACS unsubstantiated the allegations of the report against the BM due to lack of credible evidence. ACS based its decision on the LE's classification of the SC's cause of death as SIDS. Prior to the fatality, the BM noticed that the SC was breathing differently and sought medical attention. The SC's PCP examined the SC and deemed him fine. Additionally, the ME and LE determined that there were no signs of foul play and neither parent contributed to the SC's death.

### Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

NY-21-041 FINAL Page 3 of 10



| Office of Children and Family Services  Child Fatality Report   |  |
|---|--|
| Safety Assessment:  • Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:   |  |
| <ul> <li>Approved Initial Safety Assessment?</li> </ul>   | Yes  |
| Safety assessment due at the time of determination?   | Yes  |
| • Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?  | Yes  |
| <b>Determination:</b>   |  |
| <ul> <li>Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all<br/>allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the<br/>investigation?</li> </ul> | Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations. |
| <ul> <li>Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate<br/>appropriate?</li> </ul>  | Yes  |
| Was the decision to close the case appropriate?   | N/A  |
| Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory  | Yes  |
| or regulatory requirements? Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?   | Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.                   |
| <b>Explain:</b> The family moved out of jurisdiction where the LDSS assessed the SSs and deemed   | I them safe in the care of their BM.                                   |
| Required Actions Related to the Fatality  |  |
| Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)?   Yes   No   |  |
| Fatality-Related Information and Investigative  | Activities   |
| Incident Information  |  |
| Incident information  |  |
| <b>Date of Death:</b> 04/13/2021  | AM   |
| Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death:  | 06:00 AM   |
| County where fatality incident occurred: Was 911 or local emergency number called? Time of Call: Did EMS respond to the scene?  | Bronx<br>Yes<br>06:16 AM<br>Yes  |

No

Driving / Vehicle occupant

At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs?

Working

Child's activity at time of incident:

 $\boxtimes$  Sleeping

| office of Children and Family Services   | Child Fatality Report |         |
|--|-----------------------|---------|
| ☐ Playing ☐ Other  | ☐ Eating              | Unknown |
| Did child have supervision at time of At time of incident was supervisor in At time of incident supervisor was:  Distracted Asleep | 8                     |         |
| Total number of deaths at incident e<br>Children ages 0-18: 1<br>Adults: 0   | event:                |         |

#### **Household Composition at time of Fatality**

| Household                  | Relationship   | Role                | Gender | Age        |
|----------------------------|----------------|---------------------|--------|------------|
| Deceased Child's Household | Deceased Child | Alleged Victim      | Male   | 2 Month(s) |
| Deceased Child's Household | Father         | No Role             | Male   | 31 Year(s) |
| Deceased Child's Household | Mother         | Alleged Perpetrator | Female | 23 Year(s) |
| Deceased Child's Household | Sibling        | No Role             | Male   | 3 Year(s)  |
| Deceased Child's Household | Sibling        | No Role             | Male   | 2 Year(s)  |

#### **LDSS Response**

On 4/13/2021, ACS contacted the hospital staff and LE. The hospital staff did not report any concerns regarding the family. LE did not deem the SC's death suspicious and stated that criminal charges would not be filed against the parents.

On 4/13/2021, ACS visited the family. The BM denied she rolled over on the SC. She also denied it was her pattern to cosleep with the SC. She stated she had the SC in the bed with her at the time of the incident because the SC was fussy. The BF stated that a day prior to his death, the SC appeared happy and not in distress. ACS assessed the SSs in the home to be well cared for, with no marks or bruises. According to the family, the SSs had developmental delays and were receiving services from early intervention (EI) and the school district. The family's home did not present any safety or health hazards. ACS discussed with the BM appropriate sleeping arrangements and offered to provide two toddler beds for the SSs.

On 4/20/2021, ACS held a child safety conference (CSC). The CSC did not recommend court involvement for the family. The family agreed to engage in PPRS services.

On 4/27/2021, the service provider did not report any concerns about the parents. The SSs received EI services.

On 4/27/2021, ACS made a follow up visit to the family. The BM reported that she and the BF were no longer together and would be relocating out of state. ACS assessed the SSs to be well with no suspicious bruises or marks on their bodies at the time of the visit.

On 4/29/2021, the BF reported that he had returned home, and everything was fine with his family.

NY-21-041 FINAL Page 5 of 10



On 5/3/2021, the BM asked ACS if the toddler beds for the SSs could be delivered to her new home.

On 5/5/2021, ACS visited the SSs' DC. The DC provider did not report any concerns about the parents or the SSs. ACS observed the SSs to be well with no concerns.

On 5/7/2021, the service provider reported that due to the BM relocating out of state, the provider agency would not continue to service the family. The provider agency would provide a referral for the BM to follow up with other agencies at her new place of residence.

On 5/10/2021, ACS contacted the out of state LDSS where the family relocated to and requested continuous assessment of the family.

On 5/13/2021, the LDSS staff made a courtesy visit to the family and did not document any concerns. The staff referred the family for grief counseling. The staff determined the family did not need additional services and closed the case.

On 5/17/2021, the school staff, the DC staff, and the service provider did not report any behavioral changes for the SSs since the SC's passing.

On 5/18/2021, the SC's PCP did not have any concerns about the BM or the care she gave her children.

On 5/18/2021, the BM reported the family was doing fine, but stated she needed childcare services. ACS advised the BM to follow up with the service referrals provided by her LDSS worker.

Between 5/24/2021 and 6/8/2021, ACS maintained casework contacts with the family and virtually assessed the SSs. They both appeared well. They had started DC and there had been no reported concerns.

On 6/11/2021, ACS UNSUB the allegations of the report against the BM.

On 10/6/2021, ACS reported based on religious beliefs, the family objected to an autopsy. The ME ruled that the manner and cause of death were undetermined.

#### Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Undetermined

**Primary Cause of Death:** Undetermined if injury or medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

#### Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

#### **SCR Fatality Report Summary**

| Alleged Victim(s)                            | Alleged Perpetrator(s)                 | Allegation(s)  | Allegation<br>Outcome |
|--|--|----------------|-----------------------|
| 057041 - Deceased Child, Male, 2<br>Month(s) | 057042 - Mother, Female, 23<br>Year(s) | DOA / Fatality | Unsubstantiated       |

NY-21-041 FINAL Page 6 of 10



| 057041 - Deceased Child, Male, 2 | 057042 - Mother, Female, 23 | Inadequate   | Unsubstantiated |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------|-----------------|
| Month(s)                         | Year(s)                     | Guardianship |                 |

### **CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities**

|   | Yes         | No | N/A         | Unable to Determine |
|---|-------------|----|-------------|---------------------|
| All children observed?  | $\boxtimes$ |    |             |                     |
| When appropriate, children were interviewed?  |             |    | $\boxtimes$ |                     |
| Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?  | $\boxtimes$ |    |             |                     |
| All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?   |             |    | $\boxtimes$ |                     |
| Contact with source?  | $\boxtimes$ |    |             |                     |
| All appropriate Collaterals contacted?  | $\boxtimes$ |    |             |                     |
| Was a death-scene investigation performed?  | $\boxtimes$ |    |             |                     |
| Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)? |             |    |             |                     |
| Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?   | $\boxtimes$ |    |             |                     |
| Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?  |             |    |             |                     |

#### **Fatality Safety Assessment Activities**

| • •   |             |             |            |                     |
|---|-------------|-------------|------------|---------------------|
|   | Yes         | No          | N/A        | Unable to Determine |
| Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?   | $\boxtimes$ |             |            |                     |
| Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to shousehold named in the report:  | urviving    | siblings/o  | ther child | lren in the         |
| Within 24 hours?  | $\boxtimes$ |             |            |                     |
| At 7 days?  | $\boxtimes$ |             |            |                     |
| At 30 days?   | $\boxtimes$ |             |            |                     |
| Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?  | $\boxtimes$ |             |            |                     |
| Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?  |             | $\boxtimes$ |            |                     |
|   |             |             |            |                     |
| When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate? | $\boxtimes$ |             |            |                     |

Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment Profile



|  |                            |                            |                                | Yes            | No                          | N/A         | Unable to Determine        |
|--|----------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|-------------|----------------------------|
| Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate   | in this case               | ?                          |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| During the course of the investigation, we gathered to assess risk to all surviving si household?  |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Was there an adequate assessment of the  | e family's n               | eed for se                 | rvices?                        |                |                             |             |                            |
| Did the protective factors in this case red<br>in Family Court at any time during or a   | -                          |                            | -                              |                |                             |             |                            |
| Were appropriate/needed services offere  | ed in this ca              | ise                        |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Diagomont  | Activities in              | Dosnonso to                | the Fatality                   | Invoctigatio   | an .                        |             |                            |
| 1 lacement   | ACTIVITIES III             | Kesponse to                | the Patanty                    | mvesugano      | )II                         |             |                            |
|  |                            |                            |                                | Yes            | No                          | N/A         | Unable to Determine        |
| Did the safety factors in the case show the siblings/other children in the household care at any time during this fatality investigations. | be removed                 |                            | 0                              |                |                             |             |                            |
| Were there surviving children in the hou<br>as a result of this fatality report / investi<br>to this fatality?                             |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
|  | I agal A ativ              | ity Dalatad                | to the Fatality                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Was there legal activity as a result of the  | fatality inv               | vestigation                |                                | no legal a     | •                           |             |                            |
| 501,1000 2   | 10,1404 00 0               |                            | a response to                  |                | ,                           |             |                            |
| Services   | Provided<br>After<br>Death | Offered,<br>but<br>Refused | Offered,<br>Unknown<br>if Used | Not<br>Offered | Needed<br>but<br>Unavailabl | N/A         | CDR<br>Lead to<br>Referral |
| Bereavement counseling   |                            |                            | $\boxtimes$                    |                |                             |             |                            |
| Economic support   |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Funeral arrangements   |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Housing assistance   |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Mental health services   |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Foster care  |                            |                            |                                |                |                             | $\boxtimes$ |                            |
| Health care  |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Legal services   |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |
| Family nlanning  |                            |                            |                                |                |                             |             |                            |

NY-21-041 FINAL Page 8 of 10

| NEW YORK Office of Children and Family Services   | Child  | Fatality   | Roport                                 | 4                             |                                       |                |        |
|---|--|--|--|-------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------|--------|
| and Family Services   | Ciliu  | r atanty   | Report                                 | <u> </u>                      |                                       |                |        |
| Homemaking Services   |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Parenting Skills  |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Domestic Violence Services  |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Early Intervention  |  |  | $\square$                              |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Alcohol/Substance abuse   |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Child Care  |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Intensive case management   |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Family or others as safety resources  |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Other   |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Other   |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| fatality? Yes Explain: PPRS services were discussed.  | History  | Prior to tl  | ne Fatality                            | y                             |                                       |                |        |
|   |  |  |  |                               |                                       |                |        |
| Did the child have a history of alleged ch  |  | hild Informa   |  |                               |                                       | No             |        |
| Was the child ever placed outside of the  | ild abuse/r<br>home prio   | naltreatme<br>r to the dea                               | nt?<br>th?                             |                               |                                       | No             |        |
| Was the child ever placed outside of the Were there any siblings ever placed outs   | ild abuse/r<br>home prior<br>ide of the h  | naltreatme<br>r to the dea<br>nome prior                 | nt?<br>th?                             | d's death?                    |                                       | No<br>No       |        |
| Was the child ever placed outside of the  | ild abuse/r<br>home prior<br>ide of the h  | naltreatme<br>r to the dea<br>nome prior                 | nt?<br>th?                             | d's death?                    |                                       | No             |        |
| Were there any siblings ever placed outs  | ild abuse/r<br>home prior<br>ide of the b<br>weeks befor                         | naltreatme<br>r to the dea<br>nome prior                 | nt?<br>th?<br>to this chil             | d's death?                    |                                       | No<br>No       |        |
| Was the child ever placed outside of the Were there any siblings ever placed outs   | ild abuse/r<br>home prior<br>ide of the h<br>weeks befor<br>Infants              | naltreatme<br>r to the dea<br>nome prior<br>re death?    | nt?<br>th?<br>to this chil<br>Year Old | Had hea                       | vy alcohol us<br>tobacco<br>cit drugs | No<br>No<br>No |        |
| Was the child ever placed outside of the Were there any siblings ever placed outs Was the child acutely ill during the two versions  During pregnancy, mother:  Had medical complications / infections  Misused over-the-counter or prescription  Experienced domestic violence | ild abuse/r home prior ide of the h weeks before  Infants  a drugs  e any of the | naltreatme r to the dea nome prior re death? s Under One | nt?<br>th?<br>to this chil<br>Year Old | ☐ Had head Smoked ☐ Used illi | tobacco<br>cit drugs<br>al alcohol ef | No<br>No<br>No | ndrome |

**CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality** 

There was no CPS investigative history more than three years prior to the fatality.

There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the fatality.

FINAL NY-21-041 Page 9 of 10



#### **Known CPS History Outside of NYS**

The family did not have any known CPS history outside of New York State.

### **Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality**

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

#### **Recommended Action(s)**

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes?  $\square$ Yes  $\boxtimes$ No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review?  $\square$ Yes  $\boxtimes$ No