

Report Identification Number: SV-16-037 Prepared by: Spring Valley Regional Office

Issue Date: 1/12/2017

This	s report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:
X	A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
	The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
	The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
	The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 1 of 11



Abbreviations

Relationships					
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child			
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child			
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father			
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider			
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father			
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle			
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling				

	Contacts	
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPR-Cardio-pulmonary Resuscitation		
	Allegations	
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Others	
	Miscellaneous	
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police
Service	Services	Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 2 of 11



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Rockland **Date of Death:** 09/08/2016

Age: 1 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 09/08/2016

Presenting Information

On 9/8/2016, a case was called in to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment listing allegations of DOA/Fatality and Inadequate Guardianship regarding the mother and father on behalf of the 1-month-old male subject child. This report stated the subject child presented with cardiac arrest and had no pre-existing medical conditions and was unable to be revived by EMS. The mother and father were said to provide no explanation for the death of the otherwise healthy subject child.

Executive Summary

The investigation revealed that during the day of 9/7/2016, the subject child was acting fine and everything appeared normal. The mother fed the subject child and placed him on his back in his crib around 9:30 PM. At approximately 2:30 AM the following morning, 9/8/2016, the father woke up from his twin sized bed to the sounds of the subject child crying. The father picked up the subject child from his crib and handed the subject child to the mother, who was in her own twin sized bed. The mother nursed the subject child for approximately five minutes before the subject child fell asleep. The mother laid the subject child on his back next to her in the bed. At approximately 6:50 AM, on 9/8/2016, the mother woke up and observed the subject child on his back next to her, unresponsive, with a small amount of blood coming from his nose. The mother alerted the father the subject child was not breathing. At 7:08 AM, the father called an ambulance. The father then brought the subject child outside to wait for the ambulance and began CPR. The first responders arrived on the scene at 7:10 AM and continued resuscitative efforts on the subject child for approximately 15 minutes before they transported the subject child to the local hospital where he was pronounced dead by hospital staff at 8:01 AM.

Due to religious objection, an autopsy of the subject child was not completed. As per the Medical Examiner's findings from x-rays and other external testing, there were no outward signs of abuse, neglect or maltreatment, and nothing presented as concerning. The Medical Examiner stated that without a complete autopsy, there would be no way to ascertain the cause of death. The final autopsy results listed both the cause and manner of death of the subject child as "Undetermined." Local law enforcement officials did not pursue any criminal charges against the mother or the father and their case was closed citing it was an "unfortunate accident."

There were three surviving female siblings residing in the home. The safety of these siblings was assessed and contact with the siblings was maintained. There were no concerns regarding their safety or wellbeing throughout the investigation.

All of the allegations listed on the report were unsubstantiated regarding the mother and father on behalf of the subject child. The cause and manner of death were unknown and no evidence could be shown to indicate the mother received any safe sleep education in regard to sleeping with the subject child. Appropriate service referrals were offered to the mother and father for the family, however declined. At the time of case closure, the mother and father were working with their religious leader regarding bereavement counseling services and also utilized a telephone hotline. The mother and father declined services for the surviving siblings indicating they seemed happy and fine,

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 3 of 11

NEW YORK STATE

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

however agreed to monitor the siblings and utilize external resources for them if necessary. The CPS investigation was closed on 10/21/2016.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:
 - Approved Initial Safety Assessment?

Yes

- Safety assessment due at the time of determination?
- Yes
- Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?

Yes

Determination:

 Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation? Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all

allegations.

• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?

Yes

Explain:

The decision to close the case was appropriate.

Was the decision to close the case appropriate?

Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory

or regulatory requirements?

Yes

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?

Yes, the case record has detail of

the consultation

Explain:

The decision to close the case was appropriate.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? $\square Yes \square No$

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities

Incident Information

Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death: Unknown

County where fatality incident occurred: ROCKLAND

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 4 of 11



Was 911 or local emergency number called?

NYS Office of Children and Family Services - Child Fatality Report

Yes

Time of Call:		07:08 AM
Did EMS to respond to the scene?		Yes
At time of incident leading to death, ha	ad child used alcohol or drugs?	^o No
Child's activity at time of incident:		
☑ Sleeping	□ Working	☐ Driving / Vehicle occupant
☐ Playing	☐ Eating	☐ Unknown
☐ Other		
Did child have supervision at time of in How long before incident was the child Is the caretaker listed in the Household 1 At time of incident supervisor was: No	d last seen by caretaker? 4 Hound Composition? Yes - Caregiver	
impaired. Total number of deaths at incident even	ant•	
Children ages 0-18: 1		

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	2 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	30 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	30 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	5 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	9 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	2 Year(s)

LDSS Response

Rockland County Department of Social Services, (RCDSS), conducted an investigation into the allegations listed on the report. RCDSS made appropriate collateral contacts including the local law enforcement officials, hospital staff, the Medical Examiner, medical professionals' relatives, and community resources. All subjects were interviewed and observed, and the allegations were discussed. Appropriate service referrals were offered, which the family declined.

There were three surviving female siblings residing in the home. RCDSS completed all safety assessments and the risk assessment profile (RAP) accordingly. All assessments were timely and accurate. The case notes were well documented, detailed and contemporaneous.

As per the medical records for the subject child, he arrived at the local hospital by ambulance at 7:40 AM. The subject child was intubated upon arrival and Asystolic Epinephrine was administered however the subject child remained asytolic

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 5 of 11



without spontaneous respirations. No cardiac motion was observed on the bedside ultrasounds and the child was pronounced dead at 8:01 AM by an emergency room physician, following continuous failed resuscitative efforts by the family, Hatzolah EMS and hospital personnel. No indication of any trauma or other injury indicative of abuse or neglect was noted.

Local law enforcement officials explained that this appeared to have been an unfortunate accident, and no criminal charges were filed. An external examination was completed on the subject child by the Medical Examiner and nothing suspicious was observed. Due to religious objection, an autopsy was not completed, and the cause and manner of death were listed as "Undetermined."

There was documentation of supervisory conferences noted in which the circumstances of the case were discussed and directives were provided.

The CPS investigation was closed on 10/21/2016 and the allegations on the report were determined to have been unsubstantiated regarding the mother and father on behalf of the subject child for Inadequate Guardianship and DOA/Fatality. Appropriate service referrals were offered to the family for preventive and bereavement services, however were declined by the family as the mother and father were receiving bereavement services from their religious leader, as well as a telephone hotline service.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Undetermined

Primary Cause of Death: Undetermined if injury or medical cause

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Medical Examiner

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Comments: The fatality investigation was conducted by an MDT team.

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

Comments: Rockland County does not have an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
031881 - Deceased Child, Male, 2 Mons	031883 - Father, Male, 30 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
031881 - Deceased Child, Male, 2 Mons	031882 - Mother, Female, 30 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
031881 - Deceased Child, Male, 2 Mons	031883 - Father, Male, 30 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 6 of 11



031881 - Deceased Child, Male, 2 Mons	031882 - Mother, Female, 30 Year(s)	Inadequat Guardians		Unsu	bstantiated
	CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative	e Activities			
		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?		×			
When appropriate, children were i	interviewed?	×			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face	e-to-face?	×			
All 'other persons named' intervie	wed face-to-face?			×	
Contact with source?		×			
All appropriate Collaterals contact	ted?	×			
Was a death-scene investigation pe	erformed?	×			
Was there discussion with all partimembers, and staff) who were presobservation and comments in case	sent that day (if nonverbal,	×			
Coordination of investigation with	law enforcement?	×			
Was there timely entry of progress documentation?	s notes and other required	×			
Additional information: All appropriate collateral contacts we	Fatality Safety Assessment Acti	•			
		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings	or other children in the household	? ⊠			
Was there an adequate safety asses in the household named in the repo	1 0	danger to si	urviving sib	olings/other	r children
Within 24 hours?		×			
At 7 days?		×			
At 30 days?		×			
Was there an approved Initial Safe siblings/ other children in the hous	·	X			
Are there any safety issues that needistrict?	ed to be referred back to the local		×		

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 7 of 11



When safety factors were present t siblings/other children in the house danger of serious harm, were the saparent/caretaker actions adequate?	hold in impending or immediate afety interventions, including			X	
	Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessm	ent Profile			
		Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adeq	uate in this case?	X			
During the course of the investigating gathered to assess risk to all survivious household?		X			
Was there an adequate assessment	of the family's need for services?	X			
Did the protective factors in this ca petition in Family Court at any tim investigation?			×		
Were appropriate/needed services	offered in this case	×			
Place	ement Activities in Response to the Fatal	ity Investigat	ion		
Place	ement Activities in Response to the Fatal	Yes	ion No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case sh siblings/other children in the house foster care at any time during this	ow the need for the surviving hold be removed or placed in			N/A	
Did the safety factors in the case sh siblings/other children in the house	ow the need for the surviving hold be removed or placed in fatality investigation?	Yes	No		
Did the safety factors in the case sh siblings/other children in the house foster care at any time during this Were there surviving siblings/other	ow the need for the surviving hold be removed or placed in fatality investigation? • children in the household report/investigation?	Yes	No ×		Determine
Did the safety factors in the case she siblings/other children in the house foster care at any time during this is. Were there surviving siblings/other removed as a result of this fatality is. Explain as necessary: No removal of the surviving siblings	ow the need for the surviving hold be removed or placed in fatality investigation? • children in the household report/investigation?	Yes	No ×		Determine
Did the safety factors in the case she siblings/other children in the house foster care at any time during this is. Were there surviving siblings/other removed as a result of this fatality is. Explain as necessary: No removal of the surviving siblings	ow the need for the surviving hold be removed or placed in fatality investigation? • children in the household report/investigation?	Yes Graph of the investigation of the investigati	No ×		Determine
Did the safety factors in the case she siblings/other children in the house foster care at any time during this to the were there surviving siblings/other removed as a result of this fatality to Explain as necessary: No removal of the surviving siblings timely and appropriate.	ow the need for the surviving hold be removed or placed in fatality investigation? children in the household report/investigation? was necessary during the course of the Legal Activity Related to the Fatalian	Yes In the investigation of t	No ⊠ ion. All safe		Determine
Did the safety factors in the case sh siblings/other children in the house foster care at any time during this twere there surviving siblings/other removed as a result of this fatality in Explain as necessary: No removal of the surviving siblings timely and appropriate. Was there legal activity as a result of the surviving siblings timely and appropriate.	ow the need for the surviving hold be removed or placed in fatality investigation? children in the household report/investigation? was necessary during the course of the Legal Activity Related to the Fatalian	Yes In the investigation of t	No ⊠ ion. All safe activity.		Determine
Did the safety factors in the case she siblings/other children in the house foster care at any time during this factoring siblings/other removed as a result of this fatality. Explain as necessary: No removal of the surviving siblings timely and appropriate. Was there legal activity as a result of the surviving siblings timely.	ow the need for the surviving hold be removed or placed in fatality investigation? children in the household report/investigation? was necessary during the course of the Legal Activity Related to the Fatality investigation? There were provided to the Family in Response	Yes In the investigation of t	No ⊠ ion. All safe activity.		Determine



	After Death	but Refused	Unknown if Used	but not Offered	but Unavaliable		Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling		×					
Economic support						×	
Funeral arrangements						×	
Housing assistance						×	
Mental health services						×	
Foster care						×	
Health care						×	
Legal services						×	
Family planning						×	
Homemaking Services						×	
Parenting Skills						\boxtimes	
Domestic Violence Services						\boxtimes	
Early Intervention						×	
Alcohol/Substance abuse						×	
Child Care						×	
Intensive case management						×	
Family or others as safety resources						×	
Other		X					
Other, specify: Preventive Services							
11141 11-64116							

Additional information, if necessary:

Bereavement services and preventive services were offered, but were declined as the mother and father were receiving services in their community and via a telephone hotline service.

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? No

Explain:

Preventive services to include bereavement services for the family were offered to and declined by the family. The mother and father were receiving bereavement services through their religious leader, and also via a telephone hotline service. Although cooperative with the investigation, the mother and father believed the surviving siblings were not in need of services at the time of the investigation, however agreed to seek help for the surviving siblings should they feel necessary.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? No

Explain:

Preventive services to include bereavement services for the family were offered to and declined by the family. The mother and father were receiving bereavement services through their religious leader, and also via a telephone hotline

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 9 of 11



service. Although cooperative with the investigation, the mother and father believed the surviving siblings were not in need of services at the time of the investigation, however agreed to seek help for the surviving siblings should they feel necessary.

History Prior to the Fatality					
Child Information					
Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?	No				
Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death?	No				
Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?	No				
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to t	his child's death? No				
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?	No				
Infants Under One Year	r Old				
During pregnancy, mother:					
☐ Had medical complications / infections	☐ Had haavyy alaahal usa				
	☐ Had heavy alcohol use☐ Smoked tobacco				
☐ Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs					
Experienced domestic violence	☐ Used illicit drugs				
☑ Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed					
Infant was born:					
☐ Drug exposed	☐ With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome				
☑ With neither of the issues listed noted in case record	with letar alcohor cricets of syndrome				
With hertifer of the issues fisted noted in case record					
CPS - Investigative History Three Yea	ars Prior to the Fatality				
There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior	to the fatality				
There is no er a investigative instory in 1415 within three years prior	to the lutanty.				
CPS - Investigative History More Than Three	Years Prior to the Fatality				
There is no known history on file for the family.					
Known CPS History Outsid	le of NYS				
·					
There is no known history on file for the family outside of New York	State.				

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 10 of 11



Required Action(s)
Are there Required Actions related to compliance issues for provisions of CPS or Preventive services ? □Yes ☑No
Preventive Services History
There is no record of Preventive Services History provided to the deceased child, the deceased child's siblings, and/or the other children residing in the deceased child's household at the time of the fatality.
Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity
Additional Local District Comments
No additional local district comments noted.
Recommended Action(s)
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? □Yes ⊠No
Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? ☐Yes ☒No

SV-16-037 FINAL Page 11 of 11